

FINAL
DRAFT

~~TOP SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

SUBJECT NUMBER

USCIB: 9.3/21 Item 2 of the Agenda for the 110th Meeting of USCIB, held on 10 December 1954.

Subject: Extent to which U.S. COMINT Resources can be Applied Effectively to Fulfill Requirements of the USCIB Master Requirements List. (USCIB 9.3/8, 11, 15, 16)

THE CHAIRMAN introduced this problem by suggesting that it first be made the subject of a general discussion. He noted that some aspects of it will be most difficult to deal with, and doubted that the matter could be resolved completely at this meeting.

GENERAL CANINE, commenting that this is not the first time he has talked on this subject before the Board, informed the members that the present requirements placed upon him list even the most minute details of the Russian problem above any other problem with which he is concerned. He pointed out that this has made it necessary for him to take upon himself, in many instances, the responsibility for digressing from the list to fulfill other requirements which he believed to exist. He recalled the provisions of NSCID Number 9, noting that they, in effect, put him outside the intelligence community, and pointed out that the actions he has described amount to having the intelligence business under the direction of someone not in the intelligence community.

GENERAL ERSKINE expressed his view that the NSA paper has a great deal of merit and said that his own paper has elaborated upon it in some respects. It was his opinion that the Board should tell NSA what to do, but not how to do it; he added his further view that the Board is, in a sense, evading its responsibility in having the requirements prepared by a subordinate unit.

THE CHAIRMAN pointed out that the Board, as such, had taken responsibility for the requirements list.

GENERAL ERSKINE then proposed that the list be revised, as a means of providing the Director, NSA with a clear directive which will not require that the whole burden be borne by him. He suggested that a report by the Director, NSA, indicating what progress he has made, would be of assistance in preparation of a directive.

THE CHAIRMAN asked if existing directives called for periodic reports of the type mentioned.

CAPTAIN TAYLOR replied that periodic reports are not provided for, but that reports are requested from time to time. He added his understanding that the proposal before the Board calls for periodic reports.

USCIB: 9.3/21

~~TOP SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 9.3/21

GENERAL CANINE stated that under present procedure he is expected to notify the Board of major changes made by him.

MR. SHELDON said that he thought General Erskine had defined the problem in two parts, namely, (1) reports, and (2) the whole subject of requirements. He added that he had prepared a series of fundamental questions pertaining to format which he would like to circulate for information and comment.

At THE CHAIRMAN's suggestion it was agreed that the paper would not be considered at this time, but, rather, would be taken up at the next meeting.

CAPTAIN TAYLOR addressed himself to the overall problem, pointing out that he has been associated with it, off and on, since 1948. He noted that the problem of fixing requirements has always been a troublesome one, and reminded the members that the present method represents a new approach which is still under test. He went on to describe, and defend, the method of fixing requirements, stating that it would appear impractical for USCIB, as such, to handle the problem. He agreed with General Canine that the basic requirements list is out of date and not responsive to the problem, adding his belief that the main difficulty, however, is due to the fact that the Information Requirements are so voluminous and broad in scope that it is practically impossible for NSA to respond to them. He did not think it reasonable, he said, to decide upon basic objectives in light of available facilities; however, he was of the opinion that a consideration of facilities does become necessary when information requirements are being prepared. He concluded by suggesting that the staff structure of the Board is competent to solve the problem and suggested, further, that the members' principal assistants on USCIBEC be designated to look into this matter and make recommendations to the Board.

GENERAL ERSKINE noted the importance of giving consideration to the capabilities of the person charged with meeting the requirements, and said that he believes missions should be assigned within those capabilities.

THE CHAIRMAN said that he did not completely agree, stating his belief that we should say what we want and work toward that as a goal.

ADMIRAL ESPE, stating his opinion that the guide lines for drawing up the list should be changed, suggested that USCIBEC and the Intelligence Committee, having the necessary technical ability, should revise the list and submit it for USCIB approval.

USCIB: 9.3/21

- 5 -

~~TOP SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 9.3/21

MR. ARMSTRONG, stating that he is sympathetic with General Canine's problem and agrees with General Erskine that a prompt revision is required, offered a procedural suggestion. Pointing out that the formulation of a better plan will lead into a myriad of details with which the Board would find it difficult to deal, he proposed that the NSA and OSD plans be sent to USCIBEC for immediate inclusion on their agenda, and prompt reporting back to the Board of a new or composite plan for adoption.

GENERAL CANINE said that if this suggestion is followed the Board should give USCIBEC some guidance. ;

THE CHAIRMAN informed the members that the IAC will devote its entire next meeting to the question of priorities, and a copy of the Committee's conclusions should be obtainable for use by USCIBEC.

ADMIRAL ESPE remarked that some guidance of value to USCIBEC probably would be found in answers to specific questions put to NSA as the result of their initial report of last July. He said it was his understanding that the questions were never answered.

GENERAL CANINE proceeded to speak to this point, dealing in considerable detail with the subject of NSA capabilities. He expressed his opinion that a discussion of the capabilities of NSA at any given time, unrelated, is academic, and explained that a report on capabilities is only worthwhile in terms of guidance received. He added that he feels that NSA has had to operate with insufficient guidance, which has made it difficult for him to do the job expected of him.

GENERAL LEWIS, stating that the consumers know little of what NSA is doing, suggested closer coordination as a solution to the guidance problem. He also suggested that the whole requirements problem be staffed for the Board and that the Board members themselves take the maximum interest in the matter that time will permit.

GENERAL CANINE, in reply to General Lewis' initial statement, indicated the number of people each of the consumer agencies have at Arlington Hall, with more or less free access to the whole operation, and said that he is surprised that the consumers are uninformed on what takes place in NSA.

THE CHAIRMAN referred to the proposal made earlier by Mr. Armstrong and asked if the members wished to specify, in addition, that USCIBEC endeavor to determine present capabilities, existing requirements, and measures to be taken to fill the gaps between the two.

USCIB: 9.3/21

- 6 -

~~TOP SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 9.3/21

CAPTAIN TAYLOR suggested, as a possible alternative means of handling the problem, that he and Captain Holtwick, or some other representative of NSA, serve as an ad hoc committee to put together for Board consideration the information required. Such a report, he said, might be reviewed by the Board and, if necessary, it could be referred to the Committee.

MR. ARMSTRONG stated that with all due respect for the ability of Captain Taylor and Captain Holtwick, he believed such a report would not go far enough. He said that he considered it a matter of concern to all and suggested again that the work be done by USCIBEC as a whole.

THE CHAIRMAN agreed, pointing out that USCIBEC may, if it so desires, designate certain members to work on certain portions of the plan. He asked if any further discussion is desired.

GENERAL CANINE asked for a restatement of the USCIBEC terms of reference.

THE CHAIRMAN stated that USCIBEC will be asked to take the papers now before this Board and, based upon an examination of the whole philosophy of requirements, come up with a suggestion for the revision of the Master and Information Requirements Lists which will make them more practical and realistic. The USCIBEC recommendations, he said, will be considered by the Board at an early date.

GENERAL CANINE said that the reason he questions USCIBEC's ability to handle the problem is because its members are primarily COMINT people and may not be sufficiently briefed on what information is available from non-COMINT sources.

CAPTAIN TAYLOR noted a peculiarity of COMINT which he thought was being overlooked, namely, reliability. He invited the members' attention to the fact that the reliability of information from non-COMINT sources normally does not get above B-2, while the reliability rating of information from COMINT sources is normally from B-2 to A-1.

MR. ARMSTRONG agreed, and commented upon the advantage of having COMINT back-up for information received from another source.

THE CHAIRMAN then proposed that USCIBEC members be asked to join with them qualified people from the intelligence field if they feel they are not so qualified.

There followed a discussion on the subject of day-to-day changes in requirements. General Canine expressed concern in this regard, explaining some of the difficulties he encounters in his effort to deal with the

USCIB: 9.3/21

- 7 -

~~TOP SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 9.3/21

problem fairly. He also described the problems which arise when any part of existing facilities become available for assignment of new missions. He informed the members that it would be of great assistance to him if he could be assured that each of the requirements put upon him has the personal approval of the Board member concerned.

After a brief discussion of this point it was agreed that it would be given consideration by USCIB when the USCIBEC recommendations are studied.

THE CHAIRMAN inquired concerning the members' views on Mr. Armstrong's proposal for handling the problem.

It was agreed that the problem would be handled initially, and without delay, by USCIBEC as proposed. It was agreed, further, that the Executive Secretary would prepare and present to the Chairman a resolution embodying the points in this discussion. Following approval by the Chairman the resolution will be forwarded to all members for approval.

DECISION: (10 December 1954) USCIB agreed that this matter would be considered without delay by USCIBEC, taking into account all papers now before the Board, together with a statement of IAC views on the whole priorities problem which it is expected will be available for information following IAC consideration of the matter at its next meeting.

It was agreed, further, that USCIBEC in its review of the problem will concern itself with the entire philosophy behind the statement of requirements, the merits of the present system, known IAC objectives, and an examination of the present capabilities of the National Security Agency, giving specific consideration to existing requirements, existing capabilities, and gaps between the two.

To insure that the USCIBEC treatment of the problem is based upon consideration of general intelligence, as well as COMINT, aspects it was understood that any member organization deeming it necessary may designate a qualified intelligence representative to work with its USCIBEC member.

It was agreed, finally, that USCIBEC recommendations, when formulated, will be presented for immediate full Board consideration.

This item to remain on the agenda.

USCIB: 9.3/21

- 8 -