

~~TOP SECRET FROTH U.S. EYES ONLY~~

~~TENTATIVE~~ FINAL

SUBJECT NUMBER

EO 3.3(h) (2)  
PL 86-36/50 USC 3605

USCIB: 29.18/5 Item 2 of the Agenda for the 103rd Meeting of USCIB, held on 14 May 1954.

Subject:

UKUSA [redacted]

In reply to the Chairman's inquiry, CAPTAIN TAYLOR stated that the Working Committee, under cognizance of the Director, NSA, and chaired by Mr. W. F. Friedman, had submitted its report for consideration by the Board.

MR. FRIEDMAN stated that the Committee report is, for the most part, self-explanatory; however, he said he wished to point out that the Committee had reached an impasse on certain points which ultimately required a split report. He proceeded to describe briefly the six enclosures with the Committee report, and said that he would be glad to answer any questions.

GENERAL CANINE, recalling that he had been the first to table this problem, requested an opportunity to express his views. After inviting the members' attention to the geographic location of [redacted] with respect to other European countries, he commented upon our efforts for the past two or three years to obtain certain [redacted] which is available from practically no area other than [redacted]. He pointed out that this coverage is essential to his fulfillment of consumer requirements, and added his opinion that it would be necessary for the Board to think in terms beyond the limitations of Appendix P to obtain what is desired. Recognizing the fact that such arrangements would represent a new policy concept for the Board, he expressed his opinion, based upon discussion with Brigadier Tiltman, that USCIB will have more difficulty rationalizing its position in the matter than will LSIB.

In response to a question by the Chairman, CAPTAIN TAYLOR reported informal information (from SUSLO, London) to the effect that the British will approve an early July conference and will inform us that the U.K. delegates will represent GCHQ, Air Ministry, Admiralty, Secret Intelligence, and Foreign Office. He also attributed to SUSLO an informal report of hints to the effect that the [redacted] have approached the British with the idea of a collaboration agreement.

THE CHAIRMAN, referring to the overall problem, stated that there were many questions to be answered. He commented that some of the papers on this subject tended to deal with procedural matters, while it is evident that the basic principle has not yet been agreed. He thought it incumbent upon the Board, before proceeding further, to make a determination that it is in our best interests to move, with the British, toward closer COMINT relations with the [redacted].

USCIB: 29.18/5

~~TOP SECRET FROTH~~~~TOP SECRET FROTH - U.S. EYES ONLY~~EO 3.3(h)(2)  
PL 86-36/50 USC 3605

USCIB: 29.18/5

MR. ARMSTRONG suggested that a prerequisite to the determination proposed by the Chairman could well lie in the answers to some of the agenda items scheduled for consideration. He referred specifically to security arrangements in the countries concerned, and estimates of the probable relative value of the information to be obtained, pointing out that sufficient reliable data on such factors prepared by the Working Group, would enable the Board to determine with greater assurance the advisability or inadvisability of closer collaboration with [redacted]. He acknowledged the validity, and importance, of the geographic considerations presented by General Canine, but expressed his opinion that there were other considerations which applied and upon which the members should be advised in detail before making a decision to proceed.

GENERAL CANINE said that if he were a member of a working group preparing the details in question he would want to know what the Board had in mind as general policy. He expressed his belief that it would be much less difficult for a working group to accomplish something if they knew, for example, that the Board had gone on record to the effect that there was a COMINT requirement which could be satisfied only by [redacted]

MR. ARMSTRONG said that he could not disagree with General Canine's statement as to the importance of obtaining [redacted] area; however, he repeated his belief that if information on agenda items "a" through "d" were made available the Board would be in a better position to determine a proper course of action.

THE CHAIRMAN added that the answers referred to by Mr. Armstrong would also help determine the accuracy of the allegation that only [redacted] could supply information on the areas now partially "blacked out".

GENERAL CANINE stated that his technicians had assured him that this was correct.

THE CHAIRMAN expressed his willingness to assume that this is true, but added that he would like to see the evidence.

ADMIRAL ESPE agreed in principle that [redacted] could yield valuable information, also that it was important, as suggested by Mr. Armstrong, to look at all sides of the problem before making a decision. He said he thought it would be difficult, however, to determine the capabilities of [redacted] without calling them in.

CAPTAIN TAYLOR stated that it is one of his duties to keep informed on the [redacted]. With this in mind, he expressed the view that we do know something of the capabilities of the

USCIB: 29.18/5

- 5 -

~~TOP SECRET FROTH~~

~~TOP SECRET FROTH~~~~TOP SECRET FROTH - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 29.18/5

EO 3.3(h)(2)

PL 86-36/50 USC 3605

[redacted] He then reviewed available information on the subject which indicated that the [redacted] effort, though small, is of high competence and in considerable measure supported by U.S. money. He pointed out that we have British reports on the [redacted] degree of competence, and added that the [redacted] organization, though slightly larger than that of [redacted], is completely new at the game. He went on to say that none of the suggestions so far pertained to U.S. competition with the British in the [redacted] field, and pointed out that the British had agreed in 1953 to permit the [redacted] which we wished to give the [redacted]. It might therefore be advisable, he said, to grant the British request for [redacted] and assume authority on our own part to go ahead with the [redacted] in order to guide their intercept to our benefit. Referring to the material which the [redacted] have requested from General Trudeau, he pointed out that it did not include COMINT, although the material supplied by the [redacted] in return may, upon occasion, contain certain COMINT information. He offered the opinion that there is no reason why General Trudeau should not go ahead with such exchange arrangements outside the COMINT field. He concluded by expressing the view that such actions might improve the atmosphere of the conference.

The members then proceeded to discuss an earlier recommendation by Mr. Armstrong that answers to items "a" through "d" of the agenda be prepared as a basis for further study.

MR. SHELDON recommended that the Working Committee complete the job thoroughly by submitting information on items "a" through "f".

MR. ARMSTRONG expressed his view that a study of "a" through "d" would provide the Board with the information necessary to determine the answer to the question posed earlier by the Chairman. That being accomplished, he said, the Board could then determine how to proceed with the steps involved in items "e" and "f".

GENERAL CANINE raised a question which he recognized to be in the "methods and procedures" category, yet one which he considered quite important, namely, the type of collaboration to be engaged in. He stated that he had asked the Board, when this matter was tabled, to approve overt collaboration rather than any type of covert arrangement. Such a recommendation was made, he said, in the belief that formal, rather than covert, collaboration inevitably produces a greater amount of more worth-while information.

THE CHAIRMAN reiterated his belief that methods and procedures should be determined after the members have agreed upon a basic principle.

USCIB: 29.18/5

- 6 -

~~TOP SECRET FROTH~~

~~TOP SECRET FROTH - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 29.18/5

GENERAL CANINE reminded the members that we have a formal request from LSIB to go beyond Appendix P in collaboration with [redacted] and noted earlier Board action in the matter. He said he is now convinced that LSIB's delay in replying to our [redacted] request was not intentional, i.e., not withheld until USCIB's reply on the [redacted] request was received.

The members considered the advisability of giving LSIB a "green light" on its [redacted] proposal prior to the coming conference. While there was a willingness on the part of some members to approve the request, if such approval were considered not to prejudice our position at the time of the conference, it was ultimately agreed that such approval should not be given, on the chance that it might jeopardize our bargaining position.

CAPTAIN TAYLOR made reference to our agreement with the Canadians and quoted paragraph 7c which provides that neither party will enter into third party (other than British) agreements without prior consultation and approval.

GENERAL CANINE stated that he had sent Admiral Wenger to Ottawa some two years ago on this very subject, in connection with the conclusions and agreements reached at the February 1952 conference in London. It was agreed with CRC, he said, that USCIB reserved the right to proceed without prior consultation in making third party arrangements concerning areas where the communications were not among the assigned Canadian tasks; however, with regard to arrangements with countries of direct concern to CRC it was understood that the prior consultation provision would be observed. He stated that general areas of CRC interest had at that time been indicated on a map, and that the portion of [redacted] being discussed was outside CRC's assigned area of interest.

THE CHAIRMAN invited further comment on the proposal made earlier by Mr. Armstrong.

The members discussed the possibility of the existing Working Group being able to present unified views on agenda items "a" through "d" in time for consideration at the next meeting. The Chairman of the Group reported on the difficulties encountered in the Group discussions, expressing his opinion that the main problem was a lack of understanding on the part of the members as to whether the Board wished merely to modify the type of collaboration arrangements which now exist, or take a completely new look at the problem. He said that it was his understanding at the outset that the latter was true; however, in view of the Board's discussion he now wondered whether he had understood correctly.

USCIB: 29.18/5

- 7 -

~~TOP SECRET FROTH - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 29.18/5

7  
CAPTAIN TAYLOR read from the minutes of the 101st and 102nd Meetings on this point.

GENERAL CABELL, who assumed the chair when Mr. Dulles was called from the meeting, suggested that if the existing committee is irretrievably split on the items to be considered it might be well to give the problem to a reconstituted committee.

GENERAL CANINE observed that there might be some merit in this suggestion, and stated that he would designate Mr. ~~Frank~~ <sup>FRANK</sup> Raven as his representative.

MR. ARMSTRONG said that his Department would continue with the same member.

It was agreed that consideration of the problem will be undertaken by a reconstituted committee under the chairmanship of Mr. ~~Frank~~ <sup>FRANK</sup> Raven, who will be notified of his committee membership by the individual member organizations.

GENERAL CABELL then asked if there was objection to having the reconstituted committee consider items "a" through "d", subject to the understanding that upon agreement on these items the committee will proceed to consider items "e" and "f" and submit recommendations directly to USCIB. He suggested, further, that if the committee fails to agree on items "a" through "d", the differences be resolved at a special meeting of the Board.

There were no objections to this procedure.

The members then discussed the matter of a deadline for submission of the committee report. It was agreed, in view of the scheduled date of 15 June for exchange of position papers with the U.K., that the committee recommendations should be available for consideration at the next regular meeting of the Board (11 June).

GENERAL CABELL raised a question concerning paragraph 4 of the proposed agenda, asking if earlier paragraphs did not include its area of interest. After a brief discussion it was agreed to delete paragraph 4.

GENERAL CANINE inquired concerning the conference delegation. It was brought out that the committee has recommended (in USCIB 28.18/1) that the delegation consist of one representative each from NSA, STATE, CIA, Army, Navy and Air Force.

GENERAL ERSKINE asked who will head the delegation.

USCIB: 29.18/5

- 8 -

~~TOP SECRET FROTH~~~~TOP SECRET FROTH - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 29.18/5

GENERAL CANINE, pointing out that this is more a political than a technical matter, and expressing his opinion that we should send a high level representative, proposed that Mr. Armstrong head the delegation.

GENERAL SAMFORD and MR. SHELDON endorsed General Canine's proposal.

Following a recommendation by General Erskine that the number of technical advisers accompanying the delegation be kept to a minimum, GENERAL CABELL suggested that the members propose specifically their delegates and advisers at the time of the 11 June meeting.

It was so agreed.

GENERAL CABELL urged strongly that Mr. Armstrong accept the chairmanship of the delegation.

MR. ARMSTRONG thanked the members, and said that he would require a few days to think the matter over, and consult with his immediate superior, after which he would make his decision known.

DECISION: (14 May 1954) USCIB agreed:

a. To accept the following recommendations contained in the first report of the Ad Hoc Committee submitted as an enclosure to USCIB 29.18/1:

- (1) The proposed letter from the Chairman, USCIB to the Chairman, LSIB.
- (2) The proposed conference agenda amended to delete paragraph 4.
- (3) The proposed composition of the U.S. delegation to the conference; i.e. one delegate and technical advisors as required, from NSA, State, CIA, Army, Navy, and Air Force.

b. Not to accept the second report of the Ad Hoc Committee submitted under USCIB 29.18/2. Instead, it was agreed to appoint a new committee, under the chairmanship of Mr. Francis A. Raven, which will:

- (1) Consider proposed agenda items "a" through "d" and, if agreement is reached on these items, to proceed with consideration of items "e" and "f". If agreement is not reached on items "a" through "d", present divergent views to USCIB for resolution at a special meeting.

USCIB: 29.18/5

- 9 -

~~TOP SECRET FROTH~~

~~TOP SECRET FROTH~~~~TOP SECRET FROTH - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 29.18/5

(2) Submit recommendations to USCIB in sufficient time to permit consideration at the regular June meeting, with a view to having approved U.S. position papers available for exchange with U.K. authorities by 15 June 1954.

c. That member organizations concerned will submit to USCIB at its next meeting the names of their conference delegates and technical advisors, keeping the number as limited as possible.

d. That Mr. W. Park Armstrong, Jr., subject to his availability, will serve as Chairman of the U.S. Delegation.

e. Not to approve, prior to the conference, the U.K. request for authority to extend the scope of their collaboration with  beyond the provisions of Appendix P, UKUSA.

This item to remain on the agenda.

EO 3.3(h) (2)  
PL 86-36/50 USC 3605

USCIB: 29.18/5

- 10 -

~~TOP SECRET FROTH~~